BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10083567 7

CASES AND MATERIALS ON CIVIL PROCEDURE

Edited by

DAVID G. KILGOUR

Professor of Law

University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY

JAN 6 1967

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

University of Toronto Press

1964

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson00kilg_1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Section 1. Early English Courts

Holdsworth 1, History of English Law 1 — 1
Scott and Simpson, Cases and other materials on Civil Procedure 6-12 — 1

Section 2. Actions at Law

(a) The original writ and forms of action

Maitland, The Forms of Action at Common Law 1-5 — 6
Stephen, Pleading 3-9 — 8
Scott and Simpson, Cases and other materials on Civil Procedure 58-61 — 10
Reynolds v. Clarke — 12
Scott v. Shepherd — 12

(b) Procedure in an action at law

Scott and Simpson, Cases and other materials on Civil Procedure 40-54 — 16
Record in Slade's Case — 22

Section 3. Suits in Equity

(a) History of Equity

Bolland, The Year Books 55-59 — 24
Maitland, The Constitutional History of England 221-26 — 25
Plucknett, A Concise History of the Common Law 690-91 — 28

(b) Procedure in a suit in equity

Scott and Simpson, Cases and other materials on Civil Procedure 164-83 — 29

(c) Equitable remedies

Maitland, Equity 301-04, 318-22, 325-29 — 39

Section 4. Procedural Merger of Law and Equity

Bowen, Progress in the Administration of Justice During the Victorian Period — 46
Scott and Simpson, Cases and other materials on Civil Procedure 183-86 — 50
First Report of Her Majesty's Commissioners for Inquiring into the Process, Practice, and System of Pleading in the Superior Courts of Common Law (1851) 32-34 — 53
First Report of the Judicature Commission, England (1869) 5-9 — 55
Millar, Civil Procedure of the Trial Court in Historical Perspective 49-51 — 58
Pollock and Maitland, 2 History of English Law 560-61 — 59

CHAPTER II. ORGANIZATION OF COURTS IN CANADA

(Not done in present edition)

CHAPTER III. COMMENCEMENT OF AN ACTION

Section 1. Introduction 61

Section 2. Selecting a Court With Power Over the Type of Litigation

Restatement, Judgments s7 61
The County Courts Act 62
The Division Courts Act 63
Shipman v. Phinn 63

Section 3. How the Action is Begun 66

McCarthy et al v. Kirk et al. 67

Section 4. Where the Action May Be Brought: Venue

Holmes v. Wainwright 70
Smith v. Scriven 71
Hoan v. Hoan et al 72
Godbout v. Truaisch 74
Quirouette v. Quirouette 76

Section 5. Where the Action May Be Brought: Jurisdiction

(a) Jurisdiction in personal actions

Buchanan v. Rucker 78
Sirdar Gurdyal Singh v. The Rajah of Faridkote 79
Re Tangye and Smith Ltd. v. The Pelican Carbon Company of Canada 83
Carrick v. Hancock 84
Forbes v. Simmons 86
Watkins v. North American Land and Timber Company Limited 86
Lawrence v. Ward 89
Gavin Gibson & Co. v. Liebenthal & Co. 90
Gilbert v. Burnstine 96
Montgomery, Jones & Co. v. Liebenthal & Co. 99
Hart & Son, Ltd. v. Furness Withy & Co. Ltd. 100
The Fehmarn 101
Richardson v. Allen 103
In Re Dulles' Settlement (No. 2), Dulles v. Vidler 112
Emanuel and Others v. Symon 117
Newby v. Von Oppen and The Colt's Patent Firearms Manufacturing Company 119
La Compagnie Generale Trans-Atlantique v. Thomas Law & Co. 121
Okura & Co. Ltd. v. Forsbacka Jernverks Aktiebolag 122
Ingersoll Packing Co. Ltd. v. New York Central and Hudson River R.R. Co. and Cunard Steamship Co. Limited 124
Worcester City and County Banking Co. v. Firbank, Pauling & Co. 127
Collard v. Beach 128
Anderson v. Thomas 130
The British South Africa Company v. The Companhia De Mocambique and Others 131
Albert v. Fraser Companies Ltd. 138

(b) Jurisdiction in Proceedings Concerning Property 148

Tyler v. Judges of The Court of Registration 149
Minna Craig S.S. Co. et al v. Chartered Mercantile Bank 153

(c) Jurisdiction in proceedings concerning status 154

Kochan v. Kochan and Reynolds 155
Phillips v. Batho 156
Summers v. Summers 160

(d) Assumed Jurisdiction

Cheshire, Private International Law 111-113 163
George Monro Limited v. American Cyanamid and Chemical Corporation 164
Kroch v. Rossell et Compagnie Societe Des Personnes A Responsibilite Limitee 166
Jenner v. Sun Oil Co. Ltd. et al 170
Brenner v. American Metal Co. 170
McCutcheon v. McCutcheon 171
Cheesborough v. Cheesborough 173

CHAPTER IV. PLEADING

Section 1. Function of Pleadings

First Report of Her Majesty's Commissioners for Inquiring into the Process, Practice, and System of Pleading in the Superior Courts of Common Law (1851) 11-14 176
Clark, Code Pleading 54-58 179
Thayer, A Preliminary Treatise on Evidence at the Common Law 484-86 181
Mercer et al v. Gray 182

Section 2. Contents of Pleading: Herein Mainly of the Claim

(a) Pleading facts that state a "cause of action": substantive adequacy

Pomeroy, Code remedies ss. 413 184
Bliss, Code Pleading ss. 136-7 185
Read v. Brown 186
Wyman and Moscrop Realty Ltd. v. Vancouver Real Estate Board 187
Allen v. Patterson 190
Washburn v. Moorman Mfg. Co. 191
Seymour v. Maddox 192
Campbell v. Walker 193
Berry v. Dole 195
Kelly v. Town of Darlington 196
McLaughlin v. Solloway Mills & Co. 196
Hubbuck & Sons Limited v. Wilkinson, Heywood & Clark Limited 197
Goldman v. Goldman 201
Hyams v. Stuart King (A Firm) 202
Kelly v. Metropolitan Railway Company 204
Baron v. The Muskoka Lake Navigation and Hotel Company Limited 205
Bedford Construction Company Limited v. Gilbert et al 207

(b) Pleading a "concise statement of the material facts ... but not the evidence by which they are to be proved": formal adequacy

Field and Kaplan, Materials for a basic course in Civil Procedure 387-88 209
Clark, Code Pleading 231-34 210

Bruce v. Odhams Press, Limited 212
Burgess v. Beethoven Electric Equipment, Limited 217
Brennan v. Jack Posluns & Co. Ltd. 219
Fairbairn v. Sage 220
Riley v. The Silex Company Ltd. et al 226
Finnie v. Webster et al 229
Clark, Code Pleading 250-51 234
The Sentinel-Review Company Limited v. Robinson et al 235
Cole v. Maunder 237
Clough v. Goggins 237
Canadian National Steamships Co. Ltd. v. Watson 238
In Re Morgan. Owen v. Morgan 240
Gray Coach Lines, Limited v. The Bell Telephone Co. of Canada et al 243
Brydon v. Brydon 245
Brunskill v. Huttonville Farm Labour Co-operative Limited and Cross 246
McCormick, Damages 32-39 248
Finn et al v. Coleman Packing Co. Limited et al 250
McCormick, Damages 47-48 252

(c) Request for relief

Dominion Royalty Corporation Ltd. v. Goffatt 253

Section 3. The Plea or Defence

(a) Introduction 254

(b) Denials

Scott and Simpson, Cases and other materials on Civil Procedure 459-61 255
Richards v. Hall 256
Wonder Bakeries Ltd. v. Furman et al 260
Herriman v. Diamond 264
Tildesley v. Harper 266

(c) Affirmative Defences

Pinson v. Lloyds and National Provincial Foreign Bank, Limited 267
Bradley v. McLennan Plumbing & Heating Ltd. et al 268
Scott and Simpson, Cases and other materials on Civil Proceudre 467-68 270
Davie v. New Merton Board Mills, Ltd. 271
Greer v. Latimer 273
Hardman v. Falk 274

Section 4. Counterclaims

Clark, Code Pleading 633-36 276
Hanak v. Green 277
Lowe v. Bentley 282
Export Brewing & Malting Co. v. Dominion Bank 284

Section 5. Reply and Later Pleadings

Clark, Code Pleading 687-88 287
Hall v. Eve 288
Regal Films Corporation (1941) Limited v. Glen Falls Insurance Co. 290
Potts v. Point Pleasant Land Co. 292

Section 6. Amendments 293

Tildesley v. Harper 294
Steward v. North Metropolitan Tramways Company 294
Weldon v. Neal 297
Dowling and Dowling v. Rud. B.C. Bridge & Dredging Co. Ltd. and Marwell Equipment Co. Ltd. 297
Robertson & Son v. Blonski 299
Slattery v. The Ottawa Electric Railway Company 300
Robbins et al v. Jordan 303
Kong et al v. Toronto Transportation Commission 305
Note, 20 Can. Bar Rev. 351 (1942) 307
Hart and Hart v. Geddes 308
North Staffordshire Railway Company v. Edge 310
Dominion Royalty Corporation Ltd. v. Goffatt 315
Sutton, Mitchell & Simpson Limited v. Kelore Mines Limited 316
Rawson and Rawson v. Kasman and Romeo 317

CHAPTER V. CLARIFYING THE ISSUES

Section 1. Introduction

Story, Commentaries on Equity Jurisprudence 319

Section 2. Discovery and Inspection 321

Brennan v. J. Posluns & Co. Ltd. 322
Wismer v. MacLean-Hunter Publishing Co. Ltd. and Fraser 325
Bell et al v. Klein et al 337
Cleveland Browns Inc. v. Kissell 339
Kerr v. Toronto Transportation Commission and Mitchell 341
Menzies v. McLeod 344
Higgins v. Higgins et al 347
Graydon v. Graydon 348
Union Bus Sales Ltd. v. Dueck on Broadway Ltd. and General Motors Products of Canada Ltd. 350
Loudon v. Consolidated-Moulton Trimmings Limited 352
Birmingham and Midland Motor Omnibus Company Limited v. London and North Western Railway Company 355
Seabrook v. British Transport Commission 359
Longthorn v. British Transport Commission 364
Crits and Crits v. Sylvester et al 367
Pelletier v. Stevenson 369
Watson v. Cammell Laird & Co. 371
Hickman v. Taylor 373
Rabin v. Mendoza 374
Duncan v. Cammell, Laird & Co. 376
In the Matter of Regina v. Snider 384
Note, 33 Can. Bar Rev. 1186 (1955) 387
Upton Bradeen & James Ltd. v. Plastic Industries (Alberta) Ltd. 392
Clouse v. Coleman 395
Johnson v. C. A. Ward Limited 397
Adischkewitz v. Booth 398
Forbes et al v. Laycock 400

Section 3. Discovery By Way of Procedures For Taking Testimony Prior To, But For Use At, Trial.

Linkon Company Limited v. Raxlen et al 401
Parker v. Parker and Lix 403
Ferguson v. Millican 404
Niewiadomski v. Langdon 408

Section 4. Summary Judgment

The Vexatious Proceedings Act 412
Arnstein v. Porter 413
Canadian Pest Control Operators Association v. Brennan and Brennan 419
Millar, Civil Procedure of the Trial Court in Historical Perspective 423
Carlino v. British Traders Insurance Co. Ltd. 424
Anderson and Anderson v. Smith & Sule Limited 426
Gottlieb v. Fine 429
Bank of Toronto v. Stillman 432
Berlin v. Berlin 435

Section 5. Pre-Trial Conference

Simpson, A Possible Solution to the Pleading Problem 438

CHAPTER VI. TRIAL

Section 1. Introduction

McPherson v. McPherson 440
Anonymous, Dyer 188B, note (1631) 448

Section 2. Form of Trial

(a) Trial by Judge without a jury

Note, 70 L.Q.R. 452 (1954) 449
Leigh v. Brooks 450
Gover v. Shurtleff 452
Brazeau v. Wilson 454
Richard v. Gray Coach Lines Limited 454
Hay v. Bain 455
Macdonald Electric Limited v. Cochrane 456

(b) Trial by Judge with a Jury

The Attorney-General for Ontario v. Cuttell et al 457
Gordon v. Imperial Tobacco Sales Co. Ltd. et al 460
Gerbracht v. Bingham 462
Flynn v. Capital Trust Corporation 463
Forrester v. Loblaw Groceterias Co. Limited 464
Mizinski v. Robillard et al 466
The Jurors Act 471
Wigmore, A Program For the Trial of Jury Trial 473

Section 3. Method of Proof

In Re Enoch and Zaretzky, Bock & Co.'s Arbitration 481
Fowler v. Fowler and Jackson 485
Fallon v. Calvert 487
Jones v. National Coal Board 490
Chambers v. Murphy et al 493
Power v. Winter 494
Buckingham v. Daily News, Ltd. 496
Macdonald Electric Limited v. Cochrone 501
Cole v. Maunder 502
Regina ex rel. White v. Fudell 502

Preston-Jones v. Preston-Jones 504
Reg. v. Ostrowski 507
United States v. One Book called "Ulysses" 510

Section 4. Instructions to the Jury 514

Harold J. Laski, "My Day in Court" 515
Henderson v. Mather and Bresaline 520
McRae v. Eldridge 522

Section 5. Verdict

Goby v. Wetherill 526
R. v. McKenna 527
Vaise v. Delaval 531
McCulloch v. Ottawa Transportation Commission et al 531
Myers and City of Guelph v. Hoffman 536
Terkuc v. Herd 539

Section 6. Withdrawing the Case From the Jury

Fletcher v. London and North Western Railway Company 545
Martin v. Canadian Pacific Railway 546
McKenzie et al v. Bergin et al 547
Langel v. Nesbitt 548
Final Report of the Committee on Supreme Court Practice and Procedure (London 1953) 549
Skeate v. Slaters, Limited 550
Jewell v. Grand Trunk Railway Co. of Canada 555
Bernardi-Mathews Ltd. v. Malagerio and Malagerio 557

CHAPTER VII. APPEAL

Section 1. Introduction

Hendrickson v. Kallio 560

Section 2. Motion for New Trial

Scott and Simpson, Cases and other materials on Civil Procedure 735 564
Leslie v. Canadian Press 565
Cameron v. Ottawa Electric R.W. Co. 567
Koebel v. Rive 568
Mercer et al v. Gray 570
Stewart et al v. Speer 570
McCannell v. McLean 575
Harrison et al v. Bourn 579
Phillips v. The South Western Railway Company 581
Ross v. Lamport 582
Piper v. Hill 586
Brophy v. Collins 589

Section 3. Appeal From a Judge Sitting Without a Jury 591

Watt or Thomas v. Thomas 592
Benmax v. Austin Motor Co. Ltd. 597
Little et al v. Little 599
Bruce et al v. Patterson et al 605

Section 4. Appeals to the Supreme Court of Canada 607

Lake Erie and Detroit River Railway Company v. Marsh 608

CHAPTER VIII. JUDGMENT

Section 1. Introduction

In Re Harrison's Share Under a Settlement 611
H. v. H. 616
Thrush v. Read 620

Section 2. Judgment Finality (Other than Res Judicata)

MacCarthy v. Agard 624
Johnston v. Barkley et al 628
Klein v. Schile 631

Section 3. Res Judicata 634

Mayzel v. Sturm, Lipton, Lipton and Trinity Apartments Ltd. 635
Brunsden v. Humphrey 637
McIntosh v. Parent 643
The Darley Main Colliery Company v. Thomas Wilfrid Howe Mitchell 648
Matuszczyk v. National Coal Board 659
Hahl v. Sugo 664
Restatement of Judgments, s. 68 Comment a. 668
Cromwell v. County of Sac 669
Society of Medical Officers of Health v. Hope (Valuation Officer) 672
Kozlakosky v. Kozlakosky and Pyzyk 681
Cambria v. Jeffery 684
Neenan v. Woodside Astoria Transportation Co. 685
Lingor v. Lingor 686
Good Health Dairy Products Corporation v. Emery 687

CHAPTER IX. PARTIES

(Not done in present edition)

CHAPTER X. COSTS

(Not done in present edition)